



January 13, 2017

President Lori Ann Guzmán &
Harbor Commissioners
Port of Long Beach
4801 Airport Plaza Dr.
Long Beach, CA 90815

Ambassador Vilma Martinez &
Harbor Commissioners
Port of Los Angeles
425 South Palos Verdes St.
San Pedro, CA 90731

Re: Clean Air Action Plan (CAAP)

Dear President Guzmán, Ambassador Martinez, and Members of the Harbor Commissions:

On behalf of the Coalition for Clean Air, we submit these comments on the Clean Air Action Plan (“CAAP”) 2017 Discussion Draft (“Discussion Draft”). Overall, this next iteration of the CAAP is moving in the right direction but still needs significant improvements to address the health imperative to clean up localized toxic pollution, address the port’s significant contribution to regional pollution, and reduce greenhouse gas emissions from port operations. We are willing partners to help shape this historic document.

Our initial assessment has identified the several issues with the Discussion Draft. Our recommendations are:

- **Public health** - The highest priority should be the protection and improvement of public health. The ports should make this explicit.
- **Criteria** – The ports need to specify the criteria that they will use to determine the feasibility of fulfilling CAAP commitments. Failing to identify these criteria undermines the credibility and meaningfulness of these commitments. Without explicit assessment criteria identified in advance, the ports leave stakeholders with the uncertainty of whether the emission reduction commitments will be met. This uncertainty makes business decisions more difficult, leaves clean technology developers and manufacturers without a market and unable to raise and sustain investment capital, and increases despair among community members who hope and count on the ports to reduce the environmental and quality of life impacts of port operations on them where they live, work, and play.
- **On Dock Rail Mode Shift** - To avoid simply transferring the environmental and public health burdens of port operations onto another community, the development of one or more inland ports



must include a firm commitment to using 100% zero emission locomotive, off-road, and short-haul heavy duty truck technologies.

- **Emissions Targets** – We are deeply disappointed that the revised CAAP does not include revised emission targets. The South Coast Air Quality Management District has identified the twin ports as the largest fixed source of pollution in the most polluted air basin in the country. The emission inventory projections submitted to the air district and incorporated in the 2016 Regional Transportation Plan include a projected 14% increase in the key smog precursor emissions, oxides of nitrogen (NOx), by 2023. This backsliding is unacceptable. The Ports appear to conflate meeting emission targets established in 2006 with achieving safe, healthy air. The ports continue to impose unacceptably high environmental health risks to neighboring communities and contribute greatly to our region’s failure to meet state and federal air quality standards. The ports should commit to new air pollutant emission reduction targets.
- **Improved Measure Descriptions** – The CAAP needs to better articulate its strategy for cleaning up each source category. We urge the ports to provide more specifics to clearly articulate (1) the deadline(s) for achieving the strategy, including interim deadlines and a discussion of whether the deadlines could be sooner in time; (2) the enforcement method (i.e., will the measure be in leases, part of the concession agreement with LMCs, part of a port tariff); (3) the cost of the strategy and the sustainable stream of funding that will support those costs; (4) the strategy’s emissions benefits; and (5) establish a framework for coordinating incentives and regulatory requirements. This will help create a coherent plan with the ability to track progress.
- **Zero Emission Trucks** – We are pleased to see a commitment for all zero emission drayage trucks by 2035. This is a significant and necessary goal that needs to be set. However, noticeably absent from the Discussion Draft is a real roadmap with interim goals and milestones. These interim steps must be included because the current approach provides little accountability and short-term actions. The ports must lay out a cogent plan to actually achieve zero emission truck technologies, including criteria for supporting new incentive funding and a strategy for securing it. Targeting segments of the drayage market (i.e. those traveling shorter distances) that can achieve 100% zero emissions sooner than 2035.
- **Technology and Fuels** - We support the California Air Resources Board’s position of using the cleanest technology available to meet the applicable duty cycle requirements. Current technological limitations prohibit the use of zero emission heavy duty trucks in delivery and use scenarios of more than approximately 100 miles per day. Near-zero emission natural gas heavy duty trucks that have at least 90% lower NOx emissions than trucks complying with the current federal emission standard can meet longer distance delivery needs. Natural gas fuel providers have demonstrated a willingness to supply renewable natural gas for these trucks. There should be a 100% renewable natural gas requirement for near-zero emission trucks operating at the port. Early deployment of near-zero heavy duty trucks fueled with renewable natural gas provides a viable path for transitioning away from the existing more highly polluting fleet in duty cycle operations that currently cannot be met by zero

COALITION FOR
CLEAN AIR

emission vehicles. The ports, however, must identify how they plan on balancing the short-term, more cost-effective deployment of near-zero emission heavy duty trucks with the long-term commitment to an all zero emission fleet. This will require some difficult decisions. We would like to know how the ports plan on executing this strategy.

- **Railyards Must Reduce Emissions** – Pollution from rail yards must be addressed in a real and meaningful way. To date, this has been the source category with the least success. For more than a decade, communities adjacent to rail yards have asked for relief from the high levels of toxic pollution. The Ports must do more to ensure their business partners – the Class 1 railroads – do their part to reduce significantly emissions from their operations. The technology for switcher locomotives, scrubbers and CHE needs to be a part of this commitment.
- **Need for Robust Community Engagement** –The first Clean Air Action Plan included significant outreach and involvement with community and environmental groups. This stakeholder process provided necessary input on how to achieve success, measure success and ensure progress was actually made. We request that the ports commit to an on-going active community engagement and empowerment process that includes meaningful opportunities for community members to learn about and influence decisions that impact port-related environmental and public health issues. The dialogue between the ports and community members needs to improve. The ports should consider their outreach and engagement efforts as underperforming until and unless community members agree that the ports have listened and acted to address public concerns.

CCA believes that everyone has the right to breath clean air. Established in 1971, CCA is California's only statewide organization exclusively advocating for improving air quality and preventing climate change. CCA helps policy makers, businesses, and individuals make good clean air choices that protect and improve public health in California. CCA's priorities include ensuring that climate investments and benefit disadvantaged communities and promoting zero and near-zero emission technologies.

Thank you for your consideration of our comments. If you have any questions or need any additional information, please contact me at nidia@ccair.org 231-223-6865.

Sincerely,

Nidia Erceg, Deputy Policy Director Coalition for Clean Air



CC: The Honorable Eric Garcetti , The Honorable Robert Garcia



800 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 1010
Los Angeles, California 90017
(213) 223-6860

1107 Ninth Street, Suite 440
Sacramento, California 95814
(916) 527-8048

www.ccair.org